



# Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment

Original: English

## Committee against Torture

### Concluding observations on the third periodic report of the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia \*\*

The Committee against Torture considered the third periodic report of the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (CAT/C/MKD/3) at its 1310th and 1313th meetings (CAT/C/SR.1310 and 1313), held on 4 and 5 May 2015, and adopted, at its 1317th meeting, held on 7 May 2015, the following concluding observations.

#### A. Introduction

The Committee appreciates the State party's acceptance of the optional reporting procedure, which permits a more focused dialogue between the State party and the Committee.

The Committee welcomes the interactive dialogue held with the State party's high-level multisectoral delegation, as well as the additional information and explanations provided by the delegation to the Committee.

#### B. Positive aspects

The Committee welcomes the State party's ratification of the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.

The Committee welcomes the legislative changes in areas of relevance to the Convention, including the adoption of:

- (a) The Law on Prevention of and Protection against Discrimination in 2010;
- (b) The Law on Prevention of and Protection against Domestic Violence in 2014;
- (c) The Law on the Fact-finding Council and amendments to the Law on the Judicial Council aimed at, inter alia, redefining disciplinary procedures against judges;
- (d) Amendments to the Law on the Police requiring confiscation of weapons from police officers who have committed a violent offence or have been identified as perpetrators of domestic violence.

The Committee also welcomes the designation of the Ombudsman's Office as a national preventive mechanism under the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture in 2009 and the commencement of its activities, including visits to detention facilities, beginning in 2011.

The Committee notes the ongoing reform policies and programmes conducted by the State party, including:

- (a) The strategy on health Care in prisons and correctional facilities and other national strategies, including on the treatment of prisoners, as outlined by a representative of the State party;
- (b) The substantial investment in building new places of detention and repairing existing facilities;
- (c) The establishment of a new intersectoral body on human rights in 2012.

#### C. Principal subjects of concern and recommendations

##### The so-called wiretapping affair and State institutions

The Committee notes with concern the recent allegations that senior officials of the State party were allegedly involved in a number of apparent human rights abuses, including election fraud, harassment of civil society and opposition members and interference with the Public Prosecutor and some members of the judiciary. The allegations arising from this so-called wiretapping affair have resulted in mass demonstrations, claims that police and law enforcement officials have used excessive force, and media reports of a loss of confidence in the integrity of State institutions (arts. 2, 13, 15 and 16).

**As a matter of urgency, the State party should take measures to demonstrate respect for and strengthen the independence of the judiciary and the integrity of public institutions. It should ensure prompt, independent, thorough and impartial investigations into all allegations of wrongdoing emerging from the wiretapping affair, regardless of their**

source, prosecution when warranted and punishment of anyone found guilty. The Committee is particularly concerned about allegations of abuse of force by officials of the State party in response to protests motivated by the revelations of official misconduct, and expresses concern about the potential for further abuses to occur unless accountability is ensured, including investigations, prosecutions and punishments as warranted (arts. 2, 13, 15 and 16).

### **Absence of requested data**

Despite having previously recommended that the State party provide the Committee with statistical data (see CAT/C/MKD/CO/2, para. 25), and despite the Committee's specific requests in the list of issues prior to reporting (CAT/C/MKD/Q/3) for information on investigations, prosecution and penal or disciplinary sanctions, the Committee regrets that, in response to many questions, data was provided only on the number of cases registered, specifically on the questions related to articles 12–16, and that no data was provided about the results of investigations, prosecution or sanctions. The absence of the requested data on investigations, prosecutions and convictions in cases of torture and ill-treatment, as well as of violence against women and ethnic and religious minorities, severely hampers the identification of possible patterns of abuse requiring immediate response (arts. 2 and 12–16).

**The State party should compile and provide to the Committee statistical data relevant to the monitoring of the implementation of the Convention at the national level, including the data requested on investigations, prosecutions and convictions in cases of torture and ill-treatment, detention conditions and violence against women and ethnic and religious minorities.**

### **Inter-prisoner violence and prison conditions**

While appreciating the measures already taken to reform the penitentiary system, the Committee is seriously concerned at the current conditions in penitentiaries, particularly in Idrizovo and Skopje prisons, which hold 75 per cent of the country's inmates and have been described by the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment as deplorable (CPT/Inf(2012) 38). It is deeply concerned by the European Committee's reports that the illegitimate use of force was frequent at Idrizovo Prison, and that a high rate of inter-prisoner violence was prevalent in conditions described as being run on the basis of "collusion" between staff and convicted inmates. The Committee is also concerned that, despite efforts to improve the facilities of such places of detention, the European Committee found that insufficient action had been taken to ensure that they are properly staffed or offer appropriate material conditions for prisoners. The Committee is also concerned by reportedly high rates of overcrowding and that the training of prison guards and personnel is inadequate. The Committee is further concerned that the State party's monitoring and documenting of such abuses is inadequate (arts. 2 and 10–13).

**The State party should:**

**(a) Take immediate action to put an end to ill-treatment in prisons. The State party should ensure that all staff in Idrizovo Prison using illegitimate force against prisoners are subject to suspension, investigation, prosecution and penalties commensurate with the gravity of their acts. Furthermore, the State party should devise a national strategy to combat inter-prisoner violence in Idrizovo and Skopje prisons. Part of this strategy should include investing more resources in recruiting and training additional professional staff in the requirements of the Convention;**

**(b) Improve material conditions in detention facilities in accordance with relevant international norms and standards, including by renovating existing prisons and speeding up the scheduled building of new prisons, and report to the Committee on progress made in the implementation of the project to reconstruct prisons;**

**(c) Enhance measures to reduce overcrowding by introducing alternative measures such as those envisaged as part of the State party's project on the probation service and alternative sanctions, ensuring they are in accordance with the provisions of the Convention and the United Nations Standard Minimum Rules for Non-custodial Measures (the Tokyo Rules);**

**(d) Institute appropriate prevention strategies to monitor and document incidents of inter-prisoner violence with a view to investigating all allegations of abuse and holding those responsible accountable, whether inmates or guards.**

### **Impunity for acts of torture and ill-treatment**

The Committee notes with concern that 242 complaints of excessive use of force and violence by police officers were filed with the Ombudsman and the Sector for Internal Control and Professional Standards between 2009 and 2013. The Committee notes with regret that, despite the allegations from non-governmental organizations (NGOs) of widespread corruption in prison and the reports of the Ombudsman (the National Preventive Mechanism) and the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment that assault or violence in prison is common, no persons were charged under article 142 of the Criminal Code during several of years covered by the reporting period and there were no prosecutions brought or resulting convictions and sentences for the crime of torture. Additionally, the State party did not provide the requested information on effective investigations undertaken when assault or violence was suspected in prison, which is particularly worrisome in view of the report of the European Committee that the illegitimate use of force in prisons was frequent and that there was a lack of external supervision or independent oversight by the police. NGO sources also point to a lack of transparency of the parliamentary oversight committee, which has allegedly not taken any action on torture or ill-treatment by the police.

In the case of Zuher Ibrahimov, a case identified by the Ombudsman that resulted in the prisoner losing a kidney and his spleen because of a beating by a prison official, the Committee notes with concern the information received that the official responsible for the abuse of the prisoner was charged only under article 131 of the Criminal Code (severe bodily injury) and initially received a sentence of six months' imprisonment, later extended on appeal to one and a half years. The Committee is further concerned by the

allegation that he was not suspended during the appeal against the judgement.

**The State party should:**

**(a) Take measures to ensure prompt, thorough and impartial investigations into allegations of torture and ill-treatment by law enforcement officials leading to the prosecution and punishment of those responsible with penalties that are consistent with the gravity of the act committed;**

**(b) Ensure that all officials alleged to be responsible for violations of the Convention are suspended from their duties while any investigation into the allegations is in progress and, upon conviction, are not permitted to return to a position in which they place inmates at risk of further abuse. In this regard, please provide updated information on the current employment of the person found guilty in the case of Zuher Ibrahimov.**

### **Violence against members of the lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex community**

The Committee is concerned at reports of numerous instances of harassment and violent attacks against members of the lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex community, including the incident on 22 June 2014, when it is alleged that 40 young people attacked a recently opened support centre with bricks and stones, threatening some 30 people inside the centre. The Committee is concerned at the reported inaction of the State party's officials, who failed to provide protection to members of the community or their support offices; moreover, the perpetrators of this and other incidents reportedly enjoy impunity for their acts. The Committee is further concerned at allegations that the concerns of lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex people were not considered by the Government during the preparation and adoption of the national strategy for equality and non-discrimination (arts. 2, 11–13 and 16).

**The State party should take immediate and effective measures to protect the lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex community from attack, abuse and arbitrary detention. It should further ensure that all acts of violence are promptly, effectively and impartially investigated and prosecuted, and that the resulting prosecutions take into consideration any discriminatory motives. Furthermore, the State should ensure that perpetrators are brought to justice, victims provided with redress and law enforcement personnel given proper training. Finally, the State party should fully include representatives of the lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex community in any matter concerning the interests of the community.**

### **Violence against Roma**

While appreciating the establishment of the national action plans and other efforts undertaken to combat intolerance and hatred of ethnic minorities, especially Roma, the Committee remains concerned at information regarding the excessive use of force by police officials against Roma, including those committed by members of the Alfa special police unit. The Committee is also concerned by the investigation into the incident of 5 May 2013, in which approximately 50 police officers, including those belonging to the Alfa unit, allegedly forcibly entered several Roma houses and local shops in Topaana, a Roma neighbourhood in Skopje, and used excessive and arbitrary force when they were attempting to make an arrest. It was alleged that, without providing any explanation, the police harassed and pushed people, and that police officers kicked and punched and hit them with batons, injuring 10 individuals (arts. 11 and 16).

**The State party should:**

**(a) Combat and prevent discriminatory police misconduct by ensuring that all alleged cases of excessive use of force by law enforcement officials against members of the Roma community are promptly and effectively recorded and investigated and, as appropriate, prosecuted and punished, ensuring that the victims are provided with an opportunity to seek redress, including as full a rehabilitation as possible;**

**(b) Improve the training on human rights of law enforcement officials, particularly police officers, regarding the rights of all citizens and minorities, including Roma, to be free from arbitrary force and ill-treatment.**

### **Definition of torture**

The Committee appreciates the efforts made by the State party to harmonize domestic legislation with the requirements of the Convention. However, it remains concerned that article 142 of the Criminal Code does not fully reflect all the elements of the definition of article 1 of the Convention, especially with regard to instigation, consent, acquiescence and complicity for acts of torture by other persons acting in an official capacity. Furthermore, the Committee is concerned that article 143 may not apply to police, prosecutors or military officials (arts. 1 and 4).

**The State party should:**

**(a) Review its legislation to ensure it includes a definition of torture in the Criminal Code that is in full conformity with the Convention and covers all the elements contained in article 1;**

**(b) Ensure that article 142 of the Criminal Code provides for prosecution of those who attempt to commit torture, those who knowingly fail to report instances of torture and those who are complicit in torture;**

**(c) Ensure that article 143 applies to the police, the army and prosecutorial officials and that other persons acting in an official capacity can be charged under this article.**

## Law on Amnesty and investigations

Bearing in mind its previous concluding observations (see CAT/C/MKD/CO/2, para. 5), the Committee takes note of the information provided by the State party concerning the scope of the Law on Amnesty, which exempts certain persons from prosecution, stays criminal procedures and releases prisoners related to the 2001 conflict, with the exception of four cases that had been referred by the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia. The Committee is seriously concerned that the 2011 authentic interpretation of the Law ensures impunity for persons accused of human rights violations perpetrated during the 2001 conflict, which include four cases of war crimes (the “NLA leadership”, the “Mavrovo Road Workers”, the “Lipkovo Water Reserve” and the “Neprošteno” cases), the abduction of 12 ethnic Macedonians and one Bulgarian national by the Albanian National Liberation Army and the cases of six ethnic Albanian victims of enforced disappearances by the police. Following the authentic interpretation of the Law, further prosecution of the four war crimes cases was “renounced” by the Public Prosecutors’ Office. In only one of these cases was imprisonment meted out as a punishment — for war crimes against the civilian population and “preparing terrorism” — but that judgement was vacated, reinforcing the view that impunity for persons connected to the 2001 conflict remains.

**The Committee recommends the State party should:**

**(a) Take the necessary measures to ensure that all cases of torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment are thoroughly, promptly and impartially investigated, that perpetrators are prosecuted and punished in accordance with the gravity of their acts, and that victims receive redress, including medical and psychological assistance, full compensation and the means for full rehabilitation. In connection with this, the State party should take immediate measures to review the four cases of war crimes cited above, including whether there were effective investigations and the impact of the Law on Amnesty on developments in these cases. In addition, the State party should fully investigate the cases of alleged disappearances and abduction;**

**(b) Consider amending the Law to the extent required to remove inconsistencies with the provisions of the Convention and international law and standards, in order to ensure that allegations of torture are not exempt from investigation and prosecution. In this regard, the Committee draws the State party’s attention to paragraph 5 of its general comment No. 2 (2007) on the implementation of article 2 of the Convention by States parties, in which it states that amnesties or other impediments which preclude or indicate unwillingness to provide prompt and fair prosecution and punishment of perpetrators of torture or illtreatment violate the principle of nonderogability.**

## Violence against women and girls

The Committee notes with appreciation the adoption of the Law on Prevention of and Protection against Domestic Violence in 2014, and the information from the State party that this has resulted in fewer domestic violence incidents and has improved protection, including by means of education and monitoring. However, the Committee notes that information from the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy shows an increase in reported cases of domestic violence, from 447 in 2008 to 733 in 2011. The Committee recognizes that increased awareness could result in greater reporting of incidents, but remains concerned that the State party was unable to provide information on the number of prosecutions that had resulted from the new efforts and new legislation, or any data on penal sanctions and compensation. Moreover, information available to the Committee indicates that the assistance and protection measures of the State to encourage women, especially Roma women, to report incidents of domestic and sexual violence were inadequate. The Committee is also concerned that limits in the new abortion law, which specify waiting periods and authorization requirements, may endanger the lives of pregnant women requiring a therapeutic abortion (art. 2).

**The Committee recommends that the State party redouble its efforts to prevent and combat all forms of violence against women throughout its territory by:**

**(a) Increasing its efforts to prevent, combat and punish violence against women and girls, including domestic violence;**

**(b) Ensuring the effective enforcement of the existing legal framework by promptly, effectively and impartially investigating all reports of violence and prosecuting and punishing perpetrators in accordance with the gravity of their acts;**

**(c) Encouraging women to report incidents of domestic and sexual violence by raising awareness about the criminal nature of such acts and providing adequate assistance and protection to women victims of violence, including Roma women and women from other ethnic minorities;**

**(d) Ensuring that all women and girls who are victims of violence have access to immediate means of protection and redress. Moreover, the State party should ensure the availability of a sufficient number of shelters throughout the country with appropriate financing.**

## Trafficking in persons

The Committee welcomes the efforts made by the State party to combat human trafficking, such as through the Centre for Victims of Trafficking in Human Beings and the Coordinative Office of the National Referral Mechanism, and welcomes the statistics on the number of criminal charges of trafficking provided in the report to the Committee. However, the Committee is concerned that inadequate information is provided on the number of investigations, prosecutions, punishment or compensation that resulted from these charges. The Committee remains concerned by trafficking in women and minors for sexual and other exploitative purposes in the country and the very few prosecutions and convictions of offenders for such crimes under the State party’s anti-trafficking legislation. Furthermore, the Committee is concerned at the paucity of information provided since the last report to the Committee regarding the number of new State-run shelters opened for victims of the crime of trafficking and the financial resources allocated to

constructing such shelters (arts. 2 and 10).

**The State party should continue to strengthen its efforts to combat trafficking in persons and should:**

- (a) Vigorously enforce the existing legislative framework and promptly, impartially and effectively investigate, prosecute and punish with appropriate penalties trafficking in persons and related practices, especially involving women and minors;**
- (b) Enhance international cooperation to combat human trafficking, including through bilateral agreements, and monitor its impact;**
- (c) Provide specialized training to public officials, including on the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, and on effective prevention, investigation, prosecution and punishment of acts of trafficking, and conduct nationwide awareness-raising and media campaigns about the criminal nature of such acts;**
- (d) Ensure that victims of the crime of trafficking benefit from protection and effective remedies, including access to medical and legal services, psychosocial counselling, and safe and adequately funded shelters in all parts of the country;**
- (e) Provide the Committee with comprehensive disaggregated data on the number of investigations and prosecutions carried out and of sentences handed down for human trafficking, on the provision of redress to the victims and on measures taken to combat alleged corruption among law enforcement officials.**

### **Detention of migrants, refugees and asylum seekers**

The Committee is concerned that irregular migrants are transferred and detained in the Gazi Baba Reception Centre for Foreigners, where conditions of detention reportedly amount to inhuman and degrading treatment in violation of the Convention, including overcrowding. The Committee is concerned about information received that unaccompanied minors are detained, including in the same facilities as adults, and that special guardians appointed to help the minors allegedly have not established contact or obtained legal aid for them. The Committee is further concerned by the State party's reported practice of denying or revoking the applications of refugees and asylum seekers on grounds of a threat to national security, without allowing for the applicant to challenge those decisions, such as before an appeal body. The Committee is deeply concerned by the reported practice of expulsions without a proper assessment of whether an individual may be subjected to torture, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment on return to the country to which they are expelled (art. 3).

**The State party should:**

- (a) Ensure that detention is only applied as a last resort, when determined to be strictly necessary in each individual case and for as short a period as possible, and that alternatives to detention are available in law and implemented in practice;**
- (b) Adopt all measures necessary to ensure that stateless persons whose asylum claims have been refused, as well as asylum seekers, irregular migrants and refugees, are not held in detention indefinitely, by including statutory time limits for detention and access to an effective judicial remedy to review the necessity of the detention;**
- (c) Immediately take measures to put an end to the inhuman and degrading conditions of detention in the Gazi Baba detention centre, for example by closing it and establishing alternative punishments;**
- (d) Ensure full compliance with its obligations under article 3 of the Convention in respect of non-refoulement by ensuring that no person will be returned in violation of article 3 and, in addition, that everyone will be given the opportunity to submit evidence to refute allegations that they constitute a danger to the security of the country, including before an appeal body;**
- (e) Find alternative accommodation for unaccompanied minors so that they are not kept in the same facilities as the adults. The appointed special guardians should regularly contact the minors and take measures to provide legal aid for them, including by contacting appropriate humanitarian organizations.**

### **Ombudsman and the national preventive mechanism**

The Committee notes with interest that, after the Office of the Ombudsman was designated as the national preventive mechanism, a number of preventive and unannounced visits were made to detention facilities, including 32 preventive visits and unannounced visits to 25 places of confinement in 2012. The Committee is concerned at reports that the Ombudsman is unable to visit all places of detention without prior announcement and that the recommendations of the Ombudsman are not implemented by other governmental agencies and departments, as there is no requirement for action to be taken in response to the Ombudsman's recommendations. The Committee notes with interest the statement by a representative of the State party that the parliament is considering amendments to the Law on the Ombudsman to enable the institution to obtain "A" status from the International Coordinating Committee of National Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights. Nonetheless, it remains concerned that the Ombudsman has been given "B" status because its mandate does not include human rights promotion activities, staff (including deputies) appointed are not sufficiently diverse and it is not fully financially independent. The Committee is also concerned by criticism that the Ombudsman was only partially independent and does not operate in full compliance with the principles relating to the status of national institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights (the Paris Principles). Finally, the Committee is concerned that a civil society-based monitoring mechanism, which was in place until few years ago, has been discontinued by the State party.

**The State party should:**

**(a) Strengthen the independent monitoring of places of deprivation of liberty by the Ombudsman by ensuring that it has access to and, in law and practice, can monitor and inspect all places of detention without prior notice. The State party should ensure that the Ombudsman reports publicly on its findings and raises with the authorities situations of detention conditions or conduct amounting to torture or ill-treatment;**

**(b) Strengthen the Office of the Ombudsman and provide it with adequate human, material and financial resources, in line with the Paris Principles. Ensure that the proposed amendments to the Law on the Ombudsman fully reflect the recommendations for accreditation by the International Coordinating Committee of National Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights Sub-Committee on Accreditation and that, upon adoption, the amendments are promptly implemented;**

**(c) The Committee recommends that the State party reinstate the monitoring of places of detention by civil society organizations as a supplement to the current monitoring by the Ombudsman.**

## **Training**

While noting the information provided by the State party on training programmes organized for 559 professional staff from social work centres, health-care institutions, educational institutions, local self-government and civil society organizations, the Committee regrets the lack of information on the outcomes of those training programmes. The Committee is also concerned at the paucity of information on specific training programmes for officials involved in the custody, interrogation or treatment of any individual subjected to any form of arrest, detention or imprisonment. Furthermore, training programmes for medical personnel for the identification and documentation of cases of torture, as well as for the rehabilitation of victims, are reportedly inadequate. The Committee is also concerned that not all personnel dealing with persons deprived of liberty are provided with training on the Manual on the Effective Investigation and Documentation of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (arts. 10 and 16).

**The State party should provide training programmes for all officials involved in the custody, interrogation or treatment of any individual subjected to any form of arrest, detention or imprisonment that focus on the State party's obligations under the Convention. In particular, the State party should ensure that all the relevant personnel, including medical personnel, receive specific training on how to identify signs of torture and ill-treatment, and should provide regular and compulsory training on the procedures established in the Manual on the Effective Investigation and Documentation of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (the Istanbul Protocol) to police officers, asylum officers, judges, prosecutors, penitentiary guards, forensic doctors and personnel working at reception or detention centres, including training on detecting psychological traces of torture and on gender-sensitive approaches.**

**The State party should regularly evaluate the training provided to its law-enforcement officials regarding the prevention of torture and ill-treatment, as well as ensure regular and independent monitoring of their conduct.**

## **Health care in places of deprivation of liberty**

While welcoming the State party's efforts to improve conditions, the Committee is concerned by the persistence of poor health-care services in places of deprivation of liberty. The Committee is further concerned at the lack of adequate health care in Idrizovo and Skopje prisons (arts. 10 and 13).

**The State party should:**

**(a) Ensure that every newly arrived detainee is afforded the right to be examined by an independent doctor;**

**(b) Improve access to health care, ensure full access to mental health-care services in all prison facilities and increase the professional and recreational activities of persons in detention;**

**(c) Increase the number of health-care staff, facilities and equipment, including qualified nurses at Idrizovo and Skopje prisons.**

## **Redress, compensation and rehabilitation of victims**

While noting that the Law on Criminal Procedure provides for redress, the Committee regrets that there was no information provided in response to its request in the list of issues prior to reporting for detailed information on the measures taken to ensure and guarantee that victims of torture or ill-treatment have the right to obtain redress and fair and adequate compensation.

Bearing in mind its previous concluding observations (see CAT/C/MKD/CO/2, para. 17), the Committee is concerned that the State party reports that it has not yet implemented any specific programme dedicated to the rehabilitation of victims of torture.

**The State party should:**

**(a) Provide the Committee with detailed information on the number of requests filed, existing assistance in relation to filing requests, the number of requests that have been granted and what kind of redress has been ordered or provided, including means for the fullest possible rehabilitation, as requested in the list of issues prior to reporting;**

**(b) Establish measures necessary to ensure that all victims of torture obtain redress, including medical and psychological assistance, compensation and the means for full rehabilitation, as outlined in general comment No. 3 (2012) on the**

**implementation of article 14 by States parties;**

**(c) Establish comprehensive programmes for the treatment and rehabilitation, both physical and mental, of victims of torture and ill-treatment.**

### **Follow-up procedure**

The Committee requests the State party to provide, by 7 May 2016, follow-up information in response to the Committee's recommendations contained in paragraph 8, concerning the investigations into allegations of wrongdoing emerging from the so-called "wiretapping" affair; paragraph 9, on the absence of requested data; paragraph 10, on inter-prisoner violence and prison conditions; paragraph 11, on impunity for acts of torture and ill-treatment; and paragraph 19 (c), on the conditions of detention in the Gazi Baba detention centre.

### **Other issues**

The State party is requested to disseminate widely the report submitted to the Committee and the present concluding observations, in all appropriate languages, through official websites, the media and non-governmental organizations.

The State party is invited to submit its next report, which will be its fourth periodic report, by 7 May 2019. For that purpose, the Committee will, in due course, transmit to the State party a list of issues prior to reporting, considering that the State party has accepted to report to the Committee under the optional reporting procedure.