



## Economic and Social Council

Original: English

### Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

### Concluding observations on the combined second to fourth periodic reports of the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia \*

1. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights considered the combined second to fourth periodic reports of the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia on the implementation of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (E/C.12/MKD/2-4) at its 32nd and 33rd meetings (see E/C.12/2016/SR.32 and 33), held on 13 and 14 June 2016. It adopted the following concluding observations at its 49th meeting, held on 24 June 2016.

#### A. Introduction

2. The Committee welcomes the combined second to fourth periodic reports submitted by the State party, despite the long delay in submission, and the supplementary information provided in the replies to the list of issues (E/C.12/MKD/Q/2-4/Add.1). The Committee also appreciates the constructive dialogue held with the State party's interministerial delegation.

#### B. Positive aspects

3. The Committee welcomes the ratification by the State party of the following:

- (a) Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on a communications procedure, in 2012;
- (b) Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and its Optional Protocol, in 2011;
- (c) Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, in 2009.

4. The Committee also welcomes the adoption by the State party of the following legislation:

- (a) Law on Prevention of and Protection against Domestic Violence of 2014;
- (b) National Strategy for Gender Equality 2013-2020;
- (c) Law on the Minimum Wage of 2012;
- (d) Law on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men of 2012;
- (e) Law on Prevention of and Protection against Discrimination of 2010;
- (f) Law on Free Legal Aid of 2009;
- (g) Law on Social Protection of 2009;
- (h) National Strategy for the Reduction of Poverty and Social Exclusion 2010-2020.

#### C. Principal subjects of concern and recommendations

##### Domestic application of the Covenant

5. While noting that articles 98 and 108 of the Constitution of the State party provide for direct application of the Covenant in the domestic legal order, the Committee regrets that neither specific cases nor statistical data were presented illustrating judicial practice in this regard. The Committee is also concerned at the insufficient level of training provided for judicial officials and legal professionals on the Covenant rights.

6. The Committee recommends that the State party take all measures necessary to improve awareness about the direct applicability of the Covenant among judges, prosecutors and lawyers, including by integrating the Covenant in the curriculum of the Academy for Judges and Public Prosecutors and other training programmes for legal professionals. The Committee also recommends that the State party include in its next periodic report information on the application of the Covenant by domestic courts. The Committee refers to its general comment No. 9 (1998) on the domestic application

of the Covenant.

## **Data collection**

7. The Committee regrets that the State party has postponed the population census originally planned for 2011 and that, as a result, there are no updated data on the composition of the population. The Committee is also concerned at the insufficient statistical data provided by the State party on the realization of economic, social and cultural rights.

**8. The Committee urges the State party to conduct the population census without further delay. It recommends that the State party take all measures necessary to improve its data collection system to enable the timely collection of reliable data on the situation in all areas of Covenant rights, robust analysis, and effective and efficient data management.**

## **Impact of decentralization on the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights**

9. The Committee notes that some responsibilities of the central Government, particularly in the areas of social security, water and sanitation, primary health care and other public services, and primary and secondary education, have been devolved to municipalities in the process of decentralization. The Committee is concerned, however, at the large discrepancies in administrative and financial capacities among municipal authorities, which may have discriminatory effects on the enjoyment of the economic, social and cultural rights of the people living in different parts of the State party, particularly those living in rural areas.

**10. The Committee reminds the State party that decentralization of powers by no means reduces the responsibility of the State party for fulfilling its obligations under the Covenant. The Committee recommends that the State party increase the awareness of the municipal authorities regarding their obligations under the Covenant and take all measures necessary to enable all municipalities to carry out their responsibilities with a view to ensuring that all people, in urban and rural areas, enjoy the Covenant rights on an equal basis, including monitoring by the central Government of the implementation of the Covenant rights by municipalities. The Committee also recommends that the State party conduct a comprehensive analysis of the impact of the decentralization process on the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights.**

## **Ombudsman**

11. The Committee regrets that the institution of the Ombudsman, accredited by the Global Alliance of National Human Rights Institutions (formerly known as the International Coordinating Committee of National Human Rights Institutions) with B status, is not fully compliant with the principles relating to national institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights (the Paris Principles). The Committee is concerned at the long delay in appointing three of the four Ombudsman's deputies whose mandates expired in 2013/14; at the delays in the adoption of amendments to the Law on the Ombudsman of 2003 in accordance with the recommendations of the Global Alliance Subcommittee on Accreditation; at the insufficient level of human and financial resources provided to the Ombudsman's Office; and at the decreasing level of follow-up by relevant ministries on the recommendations made by the Ombudsman.

**12. The Committee urges the State party to fill, without further delay, the three vacant posts of deputy to the Ombudsman. It recommends that the State party ensure that the draft law on supplementing and amending the Law on the Ombudsman is in line with the Paris Principles, taking into account the recommendations made by the Global Alliance, and expedite its adoption. It also recommends that the State party ensure that the Ombudsman's Office is provided with sufficient human and financial resources and that the recommendations of the Ombudsman are duly taken into account by the relevant authorities and the results reported back to the Ombudsman in a systematic manner.**

## **Legal aid**

13. The Committee is concerned at the low level of awareness of rights holders about their Covenant rights and the insufficient resources allocated to the legal aid programmes, and at the limited information provided to individuals about their rights under the Law on Free Legal Aid. It is also concerned that access to free legal aid is still very limited, particularly as a result of article 14 (a) of the Law, making it difficult for disadvantaged and marginalized individuals to claim their economic, social and cultural rights.

**14. The Committee recommends that the State party consider amending the Law on Free Legal Aid in order to ensure that all people, including disadvantaged and marginalized individuals, particularly women, Roma, people living in rural areas, migrants and asylum seekers, are able to claim their economic, social and cultural rights with professional assistance and that it allocate sufficient resources to the legal aid programmes.**

## **Maximum available resources**

15. The Committee is concerned at the overall low level of public funding allocated to the areas relating to economic, social and cultural rights. It is also concerned that some decisions concerning resource allocation have not been transparent and have not prioritized the duties of the State party under the Covenant (art. 2 (1)).

**16. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to increase the level of public spending, at both the national and municipal levels, in order to ensure the progressive realization of economic, social and cultural rights. It also recommends that the State party take all measures necessary to ensure that the planning and spending of public funds is carried out in a transparent manner.**

## **Corruption**

17. The Committee is concerned at the pervasive practice of bribery for the provision of goods or services required to fulfil economic and social rights and at the low number of prosecutions on the basis of the Law on Prevention of Corruption of 2002, particularly in cases involving high-level officials (art. 2 (1)).

**18. The Committee recommends that the State party take all necessary measures to:**

**(a) Combat corruption, including by improving public governance and ensuring transparency in the conduct of public affairs and raising awareness of public and government officials on anti-corruption measures, as well as about the unacceptability of bribery;**

**(b) Strengthen the enforcement of the Law on Prevention of Corruption and combat impunity for corruption, particularly involving high-level officials;**

**(c) Enhance the independence and functioning of the State Commission for Prevention of Corruption.**

### **Non-discrimination**

19. The Committee welcomes the evaluation carried out by the State party on the implementation of the Law on Prevention of and Protection against Discrimination. The Committee is concerned, however, that there are some gaps in the Law, particularly as regards the definition of discrimination, grounds of discrimination, burden of proof and the use of statistics to prove the existence of indirect discrimination. It is also concerned at the lack of independence and the ineffective functioning of the Commission for Prevention of and Protection against Discrimination (art. 2 (2)).

**20. The Committee recommends that the State party take all measures necessary to follow up on the recommendations contained in the final report on the ex post evaluation of the implementation of the Law on Prevention of and Protection against Discrimination. In particular, it recommends that the State party:**

**(a) Revise the Law on Prevention of and Protection against Discrimination, in particular by improving the definition of discrimination in line with general comment No. 20 (2009) on non-discrimination in economic, social and cultural rights;**

**(b) Expedite the adoption of the draft national strategy for equality and non-discrimination for 2016-2020;**

**(c) Strengthen the independence and functioning of the Commission for Prevention of and Protection against Discrimination, including through a review of the appointment criteria and the procedure for becoming a member, the establishment of a professional secretariat and the allocation of sufficient financial resources.**

### **Migrants, asylum seekers and refugees**

21. The Committee notes the decision of the State party to close its border completely to migrants on 8 March 2016 and remains concerned about all its negative impacts. It is concerned about the situation of refugees, many of whom are women and children, who were still stranded at the temporary transit centres in Vinojug and Tabanovce at the time of the dialogue, living in precarious conditions with limited access to health-care services, education and other basic services. It is also concerned that, despite article 51 of the Law on Asylum and Temporary Protection of 2003, access to employment by recognized refugees and persons under subsidiary protection remains limited in practice owing to the lack of documents required to register with the Employment Agency. The Committee regrets, finally, that the recent amendment to article 8 of the Law on Asylum and Temporary Protection de facto denies the right of a recognized refugee or a person under subsidiary protection to family reunification for a period of three years after being granted asylum (art. 2 (2)).

**22. The Committee recommends that the State party improve living conditions in the two temporary transit centres in Vinojug and Tabanovce by ensuring that the persons in these centres have access to health care, education and other basic services, and meet the special needs of women, children, persons with disabilities and sick persons. It also recommends that the State party take all measures necessary to ensure that recognized refugees and persons under subsidiary protection have access to all active employment opportunities by providing them with the necessary documentation and other forms of assistance to register with the Employment Agency. The Committee urges the State party to withdraw the recent amendment to article 8 of the Law on Asylum and Temporary Protection and ensure that refugees and persons under subsidiary protection do not have to wait for a disproportionate period of time before they are entitled to family reunification.**

### **Roma**

23. The Committee is concerned at the lack of statistical data on Roma, which does not allow for effective implementation of policies targeted at the Roma population. It remains concerned at the structural discrimination facing Roma in a number of spheres of social life and their low socioeconomic status in the State party, illustrated by very high poverty and unemployment rates, low labour market participation rates and very low life expectancy. It is also concerned that there are still a number of Roma who are not registered and may have limited access to public services as a result (art. 2 (2)).

**24. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to eradicate the structural discrimination against Roma and to improve their socioeconomic status, including by designing targeted policies and programmes for the realization of the economic, social and cultural rights of the Roma population on the basis of reliable statistical data as well as thorough and regular monitoring of the results of such policies and programmes. The Committee also recommends that the State party take all measures necessary to issue identity cards to all Roma and to address the**

situation of stateless persons in line with the requirements of the Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons of 1954.

### **Lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons**

25. The Committee is concerned that the Law on the Prevention of and Protection against Discrimination does not include sexual orientation or gender identity as prohibited grounds of discrimination and that article 14 (6) of the Law maintains discrimination between opposite-sex unions, for which the concept of “family” is reserved, and same-sex unions. It is also concerned that university textbooks convey negative stereotypes of lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons. It is further concerned that such persons are bullied, physically attacked, socially stigmatized and discriminated against and that law enforcement officials do not always take action in cases of violence against them (art. 2 (2)).

**26. The Committee recommends that the State party take all measures necessary to ensure that discrimination based on sexual orientation or gender identity is explicitly prohibited in anti-discrimination legislation and that same-sex couples have access to advantages now reserved for married couples; eradicate negative stereotypes about and stigmatization of lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons, including by revising textbooks and conducting awareness-raising campaigns for the public, health-care providers, social workers and law enforcement and other public officials; and ensure prompt, impartial and effective investigation and prosecution of cases of violence against lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons. The Committee draws the attention of the State party to its general comments No. 20 (2009) on non-discrimination and No. 22 (2016) on sexual and reproductive health, in particular paragraph 23.**

### **Equality between men and women**

27. The Committee is concerned at the disproportionately low labour participation and employment rates among women, particularly Roma women and ethnic Albanian women, as well as at the predominance of women in unskilled/underpaid jobs and positions. It is also concerned at the absence of active employment measures targeted at women and the insufficient level of implementation of the Law on Equal Opportunities of Women and Men of 2012 and the National Strategy for Gender Equality 2013-2020. It is further concerned at the large gender pay gap in the State party (arts. 3 and 7).

**28. The Committee recommends that the State party set concrete targets and adopt a time frame for increasing women’s labour participation and employment rates and develop employment programmes targeted at women, paying special attention to ethnic minorities. It also recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to fully implement the Law on Equal Opportunities of Women and Men and the National Strategy for Gender Equality 2013-2020, including by allocating sufficient resources for its implementation. It further recommends that the State party take effective measures to narrow the gender pay gap.**

### **Unemployment**

29. The Committee is concerned that despite having decreased in recent years, unemployment remains high, particularly among youth, women, Roma and persons with disabilities, and that the majority of work opportunities are in the informal economy (art. 6).

**30. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to upgrade the vocational skills of the workforce to meet the needs of the labour market; create decent job opportunities, including through implementation of the Active Labour Market Programmes; develop and implement special measures to promote the employment of youth, women, persons with disabilities and Roma, including through quota systems; and provide reasonable accommodation for persons with disabilities. It also recommends that the State party ensure that workers in the informal economy are protected under labour legislation and enjoy their rights to fair and favourable conditions of work and to social security, and intensify its efforts to facilitate the transition from the informal economy to the formal economy.**

### **Minimum wages**

31. While welcoming the adoption of the Law on the Minimum Wage, the Committee is concerned that the payment of minimum wage is made conditional on compliance with the “accomplished norm” provided for in article 2 of the Law. It is further concerned that the minimum wage applied in the textile, garment and leather industries is lower than in other sectors. As women are overrepresented in these industries, this leads to indirect discrimination against women. The Committee is further concerned that the amount of the minimum wages is not sufficient to ensure a decent living for workers and their families (art. 7).

**32. The Committee recommends that the State party bring the Law on the Minimum Wage into line with the Covenant and the Minimum Wage Fixing Convention, 1970 (No. 131) of the International Labour Organization (ILO). It also recommends that the State party immediately apply the same level of minimum wage across all sectors, including the textile, garment and leather industries. It further recommends that the State party increase the minimum wages and regularly adjust them to the cost of living so as to ensure an adequate standard of living for workers and their families. The Committee draws the attention of the State party to its general comment No. 23 (2016) on the right to just and favourable conditions of work.**

### **Equal remuneration for work of equal value**

33. The Committee is concerned that the principle of equal remuneration for “equal work with equal responsibilities in the same job position, regardless of gender” provided for in article 108 of the Law on Labour Relations of 2005 is not fully in line with the Covenant, which requires compliance with the principle of equal remuneration for work of equal value (art. 7).

**34. The Committee recommends that the State party review article 8 of the Law on Labour Relations with a view to bringing it fully into line with the Covenant. The attention of the State party is again referred to general comment No. 23 (2016).**

### **Trade union rights**

35. The Committee is concerned at the restrictions on the right to strike in the Law on Labour Relations and other labour laws of the State party, including provisions that provide for the dismissal of a worker taking part in a strike that was already under way (art. 8).

**36. The Committee recommends that the State party amend the Law on Labour Relations and other labour laws with a view to ensuring that these laws are fully in compliance with the Covenant and relevant ILO conventions and provide for full protection of the right to strike, taking into consideration the review of national labour laws that has been carried out in cooperation with ILO.**

### **Right to social security**

37. The Committee is concerned that the social security system of the State party does not cover the most disadvantaged and marginalized individuals. It is particularly concerned at their limited access to social benefits owing to the complicated procedure and eligibility criteria and at the insufficient level of these benefits. While welcoming the fact that the 2015 amendments to the Rulebook on wire transfers of funds in the calculation of income for means-tested benefits have been rescinded, it regrets the retroactive application of the amendments, which has resulted in a large number of beneficiaries being unable to reimburse the previous benefits and, as a result, losing their entitlement to future benefits (art. 9).

**38. The Committee recommends that the State party ensure that the most disadvantaged and marginalized individuals are fully protected under its social security system. It also recommends that the State party streamline the application procedure for entitlement to social security benefits and increase the level of benefits to ensure an adequate standard of living and ensure their timely payment. It urges the State party to reverse the decision to apply retroactively the 2015 amendments to the Rulebook so as to ensure the access of all those affected to benefits.**

### **Domestic violence**

39. The Committee welcomes the adoption of the Law on Prevention of and Protection against Domestic Violence. It remains concerned, however, that the Law and other relevant laws of the State party, including the Penal Code and the Law on Prevention of and Protection against Discrimination, do not ensure adequate protection to women victims of domestic violence and gender-based violence. It is also concerned at the low level of convictions and lenient punishment of the perpetrators and at the insufficient support provided for the victims of domestic violence, including shelters, legal aid and treatment for the physical and psychological effects of such violence. The Committee regrets the lack of data on domestic violence (art. 10).

**40. The Committee recommends that the State party take measures to review the Law on Prevention of and Protection against Domestic Violence and other relevant laws in order to provide appropriate protection to all victims of domestic violence and gender-based violence with a view to preparing its ratification of the Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence (Istanbul Convention). It also recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to enforce the Law by ensuring that all reported cases of domestic violence are investigated promptly, impartially and effectively and that the perpetrators are brought to justice, and that it provide adequate support to the victims of domestic violence by increasing the number of shelters and allocating sufficient funding for legal aid as well as physical and psychological treatment. It further recommends that the State party improve the LIRIKUS database on domestic violence.**

### **Poverty**

41. The Committee is concerned that, despite the decrease in the poverty rate in recent years, almost a quarter of the population is still living in poverty and thus denied the right to an adequate standard of living. It is also concerned that income inequality continues to grow in the State party. While welcoming the lowering of the value added tax on essential consumer items, the Committee also regrets that the State party's tax system, including the low level of the flat tax on personal and corporate income, is ineffective in reducing poverty and in ensuring appropriate redistribution of income (art. 11).

**42. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to combat poverty, including through the comprehensive analysis of the needs of the most disadvantaged and marginalized individuals and groups and the adoption of concrete and targeted measures to address them. Such measures could include effective measures to reduce income inequality among the population, including through reforms of the tax system and the social security system. The Committee draws the State party's attention to its statement on poverty and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (E/C.12/2001/10).**

### **Right to adequate food**

43. The Committee is concerned at the high proportion of household budgets spent on food. It is also concerned at the high malnutrition rates among Roma children and children living in rural areas. It notes the prevalence of nutrition-related diseases, including obesity and micronutrient deficiencies (art. 11).

**44. The Committee recommends that the State party take the steps necessary to protect the right to adequate food,**

including the adoption of a national strategy. The State party's attention is drawn to general comment No. 12 (1999) on the right to adequate food and the Voluntary Guidelines to Support the Progressive Realization of the Right to Adequate Food in the Context of National Food Security adopted by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations.

## **Right to housing**

45. The Committee is concerned at the lack of effective measures to provide social housing for disadvantaged and marginalized individuals and families and at the large proportion of the population, particularly Roma families, living in informal settlements in poor living conditions with limited access to basic services and infrastructure, health care and education. It is also concerned about the poor living conditions in which the internally displaced persons continue to live in collective centres, and that Roma families living in informal settlements are under constant threat of eviction owing to the lack of legal security of tenure (art. 11).

**46. The Committee recommends that the State party take all the measures necessary to provide affordable social housing units for disadvantaged and marginalized individuals and families, including especially Roma families, and to improve living conditions in informal settlements and collective centres. It also recommends that the State party take concrete steps to guarantee security of tenure for all residents of informal settlements, particularly Roma, and to provide them with such assistance as may be required to enable them to benefit from the Law on the Legalization of Illegally Constructed Buildings of 2011. The Committee urges the State party to adopt a legal framework establishing procedures to be followed in the case of evictions that is in line with the international standards and guidelines contained in general comment No. 7 (1997) on the right to adequate housing: forced evictions.**

## **Access to health-care services**

47. The Committee is concerned at the insufficient funding allocated to the health sector, the shortage of qualified medical professionals and the inadequate coverage and benefits under the Health Insurance Fund, which result in limited access to health-care services, particularly for Roma and those living in rural areas. It is also concerned that some private health-service providers charge fees for services that should be provided free of charge, as stipulated by the licensing agreements under which they operate (art. 12).

**48. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to ensure that primary health-care services are available and accessible to all regardless of geographical location, including by allocating adequate funding to the health services, securing a sufficient number of qualified medical professionals and expanding the coverage and the benefits under the Health Insurance Fund. It urges the State party to put an immediate end to the practice of illegally charging fees and to monitor the compliance of private health-service providers with the licensing agreements under which they operate.**

## **Sexual and reproductive health**

49. The Committee is concerned at the acute shortage of gynaecologists in the State party, particularly in rural areas and areas with a predominantly Roma population; at the limited access to information on sexual and reproductive health, particularly among young people, and the inadequate and outdated sex education at school; and at the limited access to modern contraception, particularly among women and girls. It is also concerned that the Law on Termination of Pregnancy of 2013 introduced severe penalties which can be imposed on medical practitioners who perform emergency abortions if it is later determined that the abortion did not comply with the conditions set forth in article 13 of the Law; this may have a chilling effect on medical practitioners and thus lead to unsafe abortions being practised in emergency situations. The Committee's view on mandatory counselling prior to abortion is that such counselling is acceptable only if it is neutral and supports the free and informed choice of the women seeking to terminate her pregnancy (art. 12).

**50. The Committee recommends that the State party take all measures necessary to increase the number of gynaecologists in the country and to ensure that all women have access to gynaecological health services within their municipality, particularly in Suto Orizari; make information on sexual and reproductive health available to the general public; improve school education on sexual and reproductive health that is up to date, age appropriate and based on a human rights perspective; and ensure that modern contraception methods are affordable to all, including by adding contraceptives to the list of medicines covered by the Health Insurance Fund. It also recommends that the State party review the restrictive provisions of the Law on Termination of Pregnancy. It draws the attention of the State party to its general comment No. 22 (2016) on the right to sexual and reproductive health.**

## **Drug use**

51. The Committee is concerned at the increase in the number of drug users, particularly among Roma children; at the removal of reference to harm reduction programmes for drug users in the new National Strategy on Drugs 2014–2020; at the introduction of provisions in the Law on the Control of Narcotic Drugs and Psychotropic Substances that regulate the medical use of cannabis but also introduce criminal sanctions for drug possession for own consumption; and at the lack of clarity on the funding of the programmes on drug prevention and harm reduction beyond the support provided until the end of 2016 by the Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria (art. 12).

**52. The Committee recommends that the State party take effective measures to reduce drug abuse; to reinstate harm reduction programmes in the National Strategy on Drugs 2014–2020; provide sufficient support for the implementation of the strategy and to ensure the maintenance of the programmes funded by the Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria; and review the restrictive provisions introduced in the Law on the Control of Narcotic Drugs and Psychotropic Substances.**

## **Right to education**

53. While taking note of the efforts of the State party in this area, the Committee is concerned that school enrolment and retention rates have decreased, particularly for Roma children, among whom the level of academic performance remains disproportionately low at both primary and secondary levels. It is also concerned that a disproportionately high number of Roma children continue to be classified as persons with psychological disabilities and, consequently, are overrepresented in special schools and special classes in mainstream schools (arts. 13 and 14).

54. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to improve school enrolment and retention rates of Roma children and their academic performance, including by providing mentoring and tutoring services and other special assistance measures for Roma children. It also recommends that the State party take all measures necessary to address the overrepresentation of Roma children in special schools and special classes in mainstream schools, including a review of the classification criteria and the adoption of inclusive and integrated education programmes.

## **D. Other recommendations**

55. The Committee encourages the State party to ratify the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.

56. The Committee encourages the State party to consider ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families and the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance.

57. The Committee recommends that the State party take steps to progressively develop and apply appropriate indicators on the implementation of economic, social and cultural rights in order to facilitate the assessment of progress achieved by the State party in complying with its obligations under the Covenant for various segments of the population. In this context, the Committee refers the State party to, inter alia, the conceptual and methodological framework on human rights indicators developed by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner on Human Rights (HRI/MC/2008/3).

58. The Committee requests the State party to include in its next periodic report comparative annual statistics on the realization of each of the rights enshrined in the Covenant, disaggregated by age, sex, ethnic origin, urban and rural population and other relevant criteria. It also requests detailed information on the evolution of the State party's revenues, disaggregated by source, and of the budgets allocated in the areas relating to the Covenant rights.

59. The Committee requests the State party to disseminate the present concluding observations widely among all levels of society at national, municipal and territorial levels, particularly among parliamentarians, public officials and judicial authorities, and to inform the Committee, in its next periodic report, about the steps taken to implement the recommendations contained herein. The Committee also encourages the State party to engage non-governmental organizations and other members of civil society in the follow-up to the present concluding observations and in the process of consultation at the national level prior to the submission of its next periodic report.

60. The Committee requests the State party to submit its fifth periodic report, to be prepared in accordance with the reporting guidelines adopted by the Committee in 2008 (E/C.12/2008/2), by 30 June 2021. The Committee also invites the State party to update its common core document in accordance with the harmonized guidelines on reporting under the international human rights treaties (see HRI/GEN/2/Rev.6, chap. I).